Estimations of the bacterial content of air can be more easily made now than a decade ago, with colony formation the method of choice for enumeration of airborne bacteria. However, plate counts are subject to error because bacteria exposed to the air may remain viable yet lose the ability to form colonies, i.e., they become viable but nonculturable. If airborne bacteria exhibit this phenomenon, colony formation data will significantly underestimate the bacterial populations in air samples. The objective of the study reported here was to determine the effect of aerosolization on viability and colony-forming ability of Serratia marcescens, Klebsiella planticola, and Cytophaga allerginiae. A collision nebulizer was used to spray bacterial suspensions into an aerosol chamber, after which duplicate samples were collected in all-glass impingers over a 4-h period. Humidity was maintained at ca. 20 to 25%, and temperature was maintained at 20 to 22°C for each of two replicate trials per microorganism. Viability was determined by using a modified direct viable count method, employing nalidixic acid or aztreonam and p-iodonitrotetrazolium violet (INT). Cells were stained with acridine orange and observed by epifluorescence microscopy to enumerate total and viable cells. Viable cells were defined as those elongating in the presence of antibiotic and/or reducing INT. CFU were determined by plating on tryptic soy agar and R2A agar. It was found that culture techniques did not provide an adequate description of the bacterial burdens of indoor air (i.e., less than 10% of the aerosolized bacteria were capable of forming visible colonies). It is concluded that total cell count procedures provide a better approximation of the number of bacterial cells in air and that procedures other than plate counting are needed to enumerate bacteria in aerosol samples, especially if the public health quality of indoor air is to be estimated.

Indoor air pollution, both bacterial and abiotic, has become a very serious concern (25). Increasingly, new buildings are constructed to achieve energy efficiency, with interior air being changed much less frequently. Thus, building air is recycled through buildings, resulting in increased numbers of bacteria in the air (26, 28), with the result that ca. 10 to 25 million workers in the United States show symptoms of “sick building syndrome” (SBS) annually. This has considerable economic impact, because symptomatic workers have reduced productivity and are subject to increased absence (32). Consequently, it is important to understand the causes and predict the effects of SBS (11, 13, 20).

The role of bacteria in SBS is still largely unknown, but it is generally accepted that microorganisms are directly or indirectly involved. Airborne bacteria have been shown to be associated with both acute and chronic respiratory disease that has an infectious or allergenic component. For many environments, it has been demonstrated that bacteria enter into a viable but nonculturable (VBNC) state (3, 25). Potentially, VBNC bacteria may play a role in SBS, and exposure to airborne bacteria that are VBNC may be associated with allergies or other respiratory problems (17).

Bacterial analysis of air samples is very difficult, particularly the collection of airborne bacteria for quantitative enumeration (18, 33). The VBNC phenomenon adds to this problem, since the most commonly used methods for quantifying airborne bacteria involve the capture of microorganisms directly on solid media, as with the Anderson sampler, or in liquid buffer, e.g., all-glass impingers (AGIs). Certain compounds have been incorporated into impinger buffers to improve the recovery of collected bacteria (16, 17, 19). In the end, these methods all depend on culturing microorganisms in order to enumerate them (6, 9, 15, 29, 31). It is assumed that each microorganism produces a recognizable colony on an artificial medium within a specific time period and under the given growth conditions (5, 12–14, 17, 30). However, airborne bacteria may not respond to traditional culture techniques.

To overcome this problem, molecular methods can be helpful in detecting and enumerating VBNC bacteria in air samples, since such methods do not require cell growth (1, 21). Several methods can be used to evaluate the viability of those bacterial cells which have lost the ability to produce colonies on standard microbiological media. For example, uptake and reduction of p-iodonitrotetrazolium violet (INT) has been used to determine the viability of bacteria in aquatic environmental samples (24). A procedure that permits differentiation of VBNC microorganisms employs acridine orange staining of samples to which nalidixic acid (NA) has been added (10). NA-sensitive bacteria show elongation. Other antibiotics can be used for NA-resistant bacteria, e.g., aztreonam or other β-lactam antibiotics (23).

The objective of this study was to determine if gram-negative bacteria aerosolized at ambient room temperature and humidity lost the capability to grow on standard media employed for enumerating aerosolized bacteria, i.e., if they became unable to grow under standard incubation conditions but remained viable, based on cell elongation and reduction of INT.
phosphate-buffered saline to a final concentration of ca. 10^9 ml was incubated at 25°C for 2 days. Subcultures were prepared on TSA plates and was produced with medical-grade air (20 lb/in²) for 3 min in an aerosol chamber collision nebulizer (BGH, Inc., Cambridge, Mass.). An aerosol of this suspension and was selected because they were originally isolated from air samples (2).

**Antimicrobial substances.** All media were sterilized with UV for 3 h followed by a 20-min exposure to aerosolized 70% ethanol. The chamber was not used for at least 48 h between trials to avoid any possibility of cross-contamination between experiments (27). All trials were conducted at room temperature (20 to 22°C) and 20 to 25% relative humidity (RH). A longer incubation period was needed to permit development of colonies after aerosolized bacteria were collected in impingers. Five plates were used to minimize error when few CFU were present (i.e., at t > 0.33). Data are expressed as CFU per milliliter.

**Results.** The culturability of all three bacterial strains rapidly decreased following aerosolization. Four hours after aerosolization, there were no culturable cells on any of the media used in this study (Table 1), although viability was retained by the majority of the cells (Table 2). There were no significant differences in the number of CFU per milliliter between TSA and R2A at t = 0 or t = 0.33 (P <

**Materials and Methods.** Three strains of bacteria were used in this study, *Serratia marcescens* ATCC 14764, *Klebsiella planticola* ATCC 15050, and *Cytophaga allgenae* ATCC 35408, selected because they were originally isolated from air samples (2).

**Aerosolization of bacteria.** For each trial, bacterial cultures were prepared by inoculating cells thawed from storage at 70°C onto tryptic soy agar (TSA). *X. marcescens* and *K. planticola* were incubated overnight at 35°C, and *C. allgenae* was incubated at 25°C for 2 days. Subcultures were prepared on TSA plates and reincubated. For aerosolization, cells were collected and suspended in phosphate-buffered saline to a final concentration of ca. 10^9 ml (optical density at 600 nm = 0.75 to 0.85). Ca. 60 ml of cell suspension was added to a sterile collision nebulizer (BGH, Inc., Cambridge, Mass.). An aerosol of this suspension was produced with medical-grade air (20 lb/in²) for 3 min in an aerosol chamber with an internal volume of 350 liters (Fig. 1). After each trial, the chamber was sterilized with UV for 3 h followed by a 20-min exposure to aerosolized 70% ethanol. The chamber was not used for at least 48 h between trials to avoid any possibility of cross-contamination between experiments (27). All trials were conducted at room temperature (20 to 22°C) and 20 to 25% relative humidity (RH).

**Direct microscopy.** Estimates of total cells in the impinger buffer were obtained by using the acridine orange direct count (AODC) procedure (7). Five-milliliter samples were treated with acridine orange (0.01% final concentration). The samples were incubated for 5 min in the dark and filtered with black polycarbonate filters (0.22-μm pore size). Viability of the aerosolized cells was determined by the method of Kogure et al. (10) with some modifications. NA (0.5 µg ml⁻¹) was used for *K. planticola*, and aztreonam (100 µg ml⁻¹) was used for *S. marcescens* and *C. allgenae*, which are resistant to NA. One milliliter of 1% yeast extract containing the appropriate antibiotic was added to 8.5 ml of impinger buffer and incubated at 25°C in an incubator shaker (Belloco Biotechnology, Vineland, N.J.) at 100 rpm for 1 week. INT (2 mg) was added to the samples on day 6 of the incubation, after which the samples were fixed with 2% formalin (day 7), stained with acridine orange, and observed with a Zeiss epifluorescent microscope (excitation wavelength, 490 nm).

**Sampling.** AGIs were used to collect airborne microorganisms. If a vacuum of at least 16 mm of Hg is achieved, an impinger can sample 12.5 liters of air min⁻¹. Air samples were collected for 3 min, simultaneously with aerosolization (time [t] = 0), at 20 min (t = 0.33), at 2 h (t = 2), and at 4 h (t = 4). Samples were collected in impinger buffer (100 mM K₂PO₄, 30 mM KH₂PO₄, 0.4 mM MgSO₄, and without 3.5 M betaine) and impingers containing 40 ml of filtered (0.22-μm pore size) impinger buffer were used for each sampling.

**Time of aerosolization on culturability and viability of gram-negative bacteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time (h)</th>
<th>No. of a</th>
<th>No. of b</th>
<th>No. of c</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S. marcescens</td>
<td>K. planticola</td>
<td>C. allgenae</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AODC</td>
<td>AODVC</td>
<td>On TSA</td>
<td>On R2A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>38,675</td>
<td>70,525</td>
<td>43,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>24,850</td>
<td>41,650</td>
<td>35,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1,740</td>
<td>1,740</td>
<td>680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1,660</td>
<td>1,460</td>
<td>760</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Bacteria were captured in the AGI. The impinger buffer contained 30 mM K₂PO₄ and 0.4 mM MgSO₄, with and without 3.5 M betaine. Total cells (AODC), total viable cells (AODVC), and CFU were determined at each sampling time. Results are presented as both total cells and total viable cells per milliliter measured by direct microscopy and as CFU per milliliter, i.e., the number of colonies growing on TSA and R2A.

b R2A medium was not used at t = 2 and t = 4 because of insufficient buffer. Earlier times of sampling showed no significant differences for these media.

c Below the detection limit.
Addition of betaine to the impinger buffer yielded significantly increased colony formation in the case of *K. planticola* (fourfold increase) and *C. allerginae* (fivefold increase). No effect was observed on the recovery of *S. marcescens* (Table 1).

The culturability of *S. marcescens* decreased rapidly with time following aerosolization (Table 1). After aerosolization for 20 min, the number of CFU per milliliter decreased by about 2 logs, and after 2 h, no CFU were recovered. Results for *K. planticola* and *C. allerginae* were similar except that the initial decline was much greater, i.e., *K. planticola* decreased by 2.5 logs in the first 20 min and no CFU of *C. allerginae* were recovered after 20 min (except for a single colony, at 2 h, when betaine was added to the impinger buffer) (Table 1).

**Viability.** The percentage of viable cells, enumerated by direct microscopy after the addition of antibiotics, did not decrease over the 4-h sampling time (Table 2). However, percent viable cells varied with the organism being tested. Addition of betaine to the impinger buffer did not change significantly the percentage of total cells remaining viable.

### DISCUSSION

From these results, it is concluded that the bacterial strains included in this study did not respond to standard culture methods after aerosolization. The plate count (CFU) provides an estimate of only those few cells least affected by exposure to air, e.g., by exposure to desiccation, sudden changes in temperature, and/or RH. The direct counts and direct viable counts indicate that most of the aerosolized bacteria remained viable for at least 4 h after aerosolization and probably longer, even though they did not form colonies on TSA or R2A. There is an indication (Table 1) that the presence of betaine increased the total (AODC) and viable (acridine orange direct viable count [AODVC]) counts. This apparent increase may be due to greater dispersion of clumps or protection of the cell wall by betaine, resulting in intact but nonviable cells.

These data demonstrate that a significant portion of airborne microbial populations, namely, cells that are viable but nonculturable, have heretofore been ignored in studies of the effect of aerosolization on microorganisms. These cells constitute differing percentages of the total population, depending on both the species and the extent and harshness of environmental exposure. It has been shown in human volunteer experiments that ingestion of VBNC *Vibrio cholerae* will result in diarrhea (4), but such studies have not been done with the VBNC bacteria inhaled rather than ingested. It can be hypothesized that cells in the VBNC state may cause SBS symptoms in human populations (6), but the appropriate studies to confirm this hypothesis remain to be done. The presence of large numbers of bacterial cells may be expected to cause an allergic response if inhaled (18). In any case, it is clear from the results presented here that plate count data will significantly underestimate the total bacterial burden, i.e., by ca. 100- to 1,000-fold. A 100- to 1,000-fold greater exposure factor can explain allergic responses in individuals simply from exposure to a large amount of cell protein (16).

Impinger buffer amended with protective compounds, e.g., betaine, acted as a protective agent, maintaining the culturability of *K. planticola* and *C. allerginae*; however, it acted in the opposite way in the case of *S. marcescens* (Table 1), suggesting action at the cell envelope, with variation in the cell envelope being a factor. Because of strain variability, the use of protective agents in routine monitoring may introduce a bias, i.e., they may act as selective agents, protecting the culturability of only a portion of the microbial population. This study was conducted at an RH and temperature approximating normal building conditions. The effect of varying environmental conditions, e.g., RH, temperature, etc., on conversion of cells to the VBNC state was not determined but will be the objective of future studies.

Recently, direct detection of airborne bacteria by employing gene probes, PCR, and other molecular genetic methods has been proposed (1, 19). This approach offers both precision and accuracy, since the microorganisms need not be grown in culture. However, these methods do not differentiate between the total number of bacteria and numbers of VBNC or colony-forming bacteria, but they do offer a highly precise enumeration of specific microorganisms, for example, *Legionella pneumophila* (8, 22). The ultimate objective is to be able to predict infection by exposure to airborne pathogens. Simple enumeration is helpful but not sufficient; i.e., the relative pathogenicity of VBNC and colony-forming bacteria will need to be assessed. Whether they are equally infective or whether the VNBC bacteria are slower acting remains to be determined.

### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This research was supported, in part, by cooperative agreement CR819901 between the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency and the University of Maryland Biotechnology Institute.

### REFERENCES


---

**TABLE 2. Effect of betaine on viability with time**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time (h)</th>
<th><em>S. marcescens</em></th>
<th><em>K. planticola</em></th>
<th><em>C. allerginae</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No betaine</td>
<td>Betaine</td>
<td>No betaine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>64.25</td>
<td>59.06</td>
<td>80.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>61.24</td>
<td>56.88</td>
<td>83.58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>55.71</td>
<td>42.31</td>
<td>78.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>54.40</td>
<td>41.33</td>
<td>83.05</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Results are expressed as (AODVC/AODC) × 100.}

* Impinger buffer with and without 3.5 μM betaine.