Soft X-ray Enhanced Electrostatic Precipitation
for Protection against Inhalable Allergens,
Ultrafine Particles, and Microbial Infections

Eric M. Kettleson,1 Jill M. Schriewer,2 R. Mark L. Buller,2 Pratim Biswas3,#

1Department of Environmental Health, University of Cincinnati, Cincinnati, OH 45267, USA

2Department of Molecular Microbiology and Immunology, Saint Louis University, St. Louis, MO 63104, USA

3Department of Energy, Environmental, and Chemical Engineering, Washington University, St. Louis, MO 63130, USA

Running Title: Soft X-ray Enhanced Electrostatic Precipitation

# To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail: pbiswas@wustl.edu
ABSTRACT

Protection of the human lung from infectious agents, allergens, and ultrafine particles is difficult with current technologies. HEPA filters remove airborne particles >0.3 µm with 99.97% efficiency, but are expensive to maintain. Electrostatic precipitation has been used as an inexpensive approach to remove large particles from airflows, but has a collection efficiency minimum in the sub-micrometer size range allowing for a penetration window for some allergens and ultrafine particles. Incorporating soft X-ray irradiation as an in-situ component of the electrostatic precipitation process greatly improves capture efficiency of ultrafine particles. Here we demonstrate the removal and inactivation capabilities of soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitation technology targeting infectious agents (B. anthracis, M. bovis-BCG, and poxviruses), allergens, and ultrafine particles. Incorporation of in-situ soft X-ray irradiation at low-intensity corona conditions resulted in (i.) two-fold to nine-fold increase in capture efficiency of 200-600nm particles and (ii.) a considerable delay in the mean day of death as well as lower overall mortality rates in ECTV cohorts. At the high intensity corona conditions, nearly complete protection from viral and bacterial respiratory infection was afforded to the murine models for all biological agents tested. When optimized for combined efficient particle removal with limited ozone production, this technology could be incorporated into stand-alone indoor air cleaners or scaled for installation in aircraft cabin, office, and residential HVAC systems.
INTRODUCTION

The simple, involuntary act of breathing constantly exposes the human respiratory system to a host of biological and non-biological particles capable of causing diseases that range from microbial respiratory infections to allergic reactions that may exacerbate underlying asthmatic conditions. Aerosol transmission has been implicated to varying degrees in a number of viral and bacterial infections, including smallpox (35), influenza (37), tuberculosis (20), and anthrax (13). Asthma, a chronic respiratory disease that can be triggered by inhalation exposure to diesel soot as well as allergens such as fungal spores, pollen, and pet dander, ranked in 2006 as the fifth-most costly health care expenditure in the U.S. at $51.3 billion (36). Considering that citizens of developed nations normally spend 87% of their time indoors (7, 21), properly maintaining indoor air-quality is clearly an absolute necessity for the protection of public health.

The capture of aerosol particles by filtration is the most common method for air cleaning. HEPA filters, which remove airborne particles >0.3 µm with 99.97% efficiency, are generally employed for applications requiring the highest level of particle removal. For example, HEPA filters have been incorporated into hospital air handling systems that service operating rooms where bone marrow transplant (32, 38) and medical device implant surgeries (6) are performed. Over time, however, as particle loading increases, pores can become clogged resulting in a high pressure drop across the filter material. This pressure drop, in turn, requires additional energy consumption in order to maintain a consistent airflow rate. Regular filter replacement can alleviate pressure drop concerns, but at a price.
Because of lower power requirements and reduced maintenance costs, electrostatic precipitation (ESP) has established itself as a feasible particulate control alternative. ESPs act by imparting charge on airborne particles which, in the presence of an electric field, are then directed to and deposited on a metallic collection plate. Corona inception is an operational condition in which a dense cloud of free electrons and positive ions is first established around a discharge electrode (16). In the presence of this corona, non- or weakly-charged particles that otherwise are inefficiently collected by ESPs become charged as they collide with ambient unipolar ions. An electric field then drives these particles toward an oppositely charged collection electrode, with physical capture occurring upon contact with the inner wall of the ESP. With airflow occurring tangential to the collected material, these devices are characterized by low pressure drop and, subsequently, have lower power requirement than HEPA filtration. The usefulness of ESP technology in mitigating biological aerosols >1 µm in diameter has been demonstrated using bacterial endospores and various bacterial species (12, 28). Other research involving electrostatic precipitation of bacterial cells and spores has focused on survival rates (i.e., bioavailability) after electrical charging as well as sampling efficiency for exposure assessment (27, 29, 30, 31, 42).

ESPs have size dependent collection efficiencies, and while overall mass-based collection efficiencies may be high (e.g. 99%), the collection efficiencies of particles in the submicrometer and nanometer particle size range, the size range associated with viruses and some allergens, are typically low (26, 40, 43, 44). In this ESP penetration window
(0.1-1 µm size range), electrical mobility, which is influenced by both particle charge and mechanical mobility, is at a minimum and consequently collection efficiency is also at a minimum. At diameters below this size range, diffusion charging becomes more efficient and particle collection efficiency increases. Similarly, at particle sizes above this size range, field charging becomes more efficient leading to an increase in particle collection efficiency. The collection efficiency of particles in this ESP penetration window can be enhanced through incorporation of in-situ soft X-ray irradiation which increases bipolar ion concentration and direct particle photoionization (17, 26). Soft X-rays generated by the emitter have wavelengths of 0.12-0.41 nm, which slightly overlaps the range of extreme ultraviolet light. At these wavelengths, the soft X-rays have energies of 3.5-9.5 keV, which makes them less energetic than hard X-rays (medical diagnostics), but more so than the majority of ultraviolet light. Hogan et al. (17) demonstrated both enhanced charging and improved collection efficiency of aerosolized bacteriophage MS2. In a follow-up study, molecular microbiological techniques were used to quantify the level of in-flight inactivation of bacteriophages T3 and MS2 passing through a soft X-ray enhanced ESP system (24).

This study aimed to apply soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitation in a fashion relevant to (1.) infectious disease control for a range of microorganisms and (2.) attenuation of airborne allergen concentration. With handling ease and worker safety concerns in mind, agents were chosen to represent a very broad spectrum of particle sizes and morphologies, including surrogates for potential bioterror agents as well as more typically encountered biological particles. Specifically, surrogates for smallpox,
tuberculosis, anthrax, and airborne allergens were aerosolized, challenged to the ESP system, and then delivered to murine models in a nose-only exposure chamber. While filter testing or biological air samplers could quantify particle penetration, the use of animal exposures allows for a truer assessment of system protectiveness. Biological indicators of infection, i.e., seroconversion, lung infectivity burden, and mortality, were monitored post-exposure to evaluate system effectiveness for prevention of respiratory infections. Airway infiltrations of inflammatory cells such as granulocytes (eosinophils and neutrophils) as well as the presence of cytokines in pulmonary secretions, which mimic outcomes in human asthma (19), were used to assess allergic responses.
MATERIALS AND METHODS

Mice. Specific-pathogen-free mice were used at 6-8 weeks of age. A/J and C57BL/6 mice were obtained from the National Cancer Institute-Frederick Animal Production Program (Frederick, MD). All mice received food and water ad libitum. All protocols and experimental procedures were approved by the Saint Louis University Institutional Biosafety and Institutional Animal Care and Use Committees.

Cells and virus. BSC-1 cells were obtained from the American Type Culture Collection (Rockville, MD). BSC-1 cells were maintained in DMEM (BioWhittaker) supplemented with 10% fetal calf serum, 2mM L-glutamine, 120µg ml⁻¹ penicillin, and 200µg ml⁻¹ streptomycin and neomycin sulfate and grown at 37°C with 5% CO₂. Ectromelia virus, strain Moscow (ECTV-MOS), was derived from a plaque-purified isolate (ATCC, VR-1374). ECTV, a member of the Orthopoxvirus genus, was used as a surrogate for variola virus, the causative agent of smallpox and a potential bioterror agent. ECTV was propagated in BSC-1 cells, purified through a sucrose cushion gradient, and titered by viral plaque assay (22), generating a stock concentration of 3.0x10⁸ PFU ml⁻¹.

Bacteria. Mycobacterium bovis bacillus Calmette-Guérin (BCG), a live attenuated vaccine strain against tuberculosis, was kindly provided by Dr. Daniel F. Hoft (Saint Louis University) and used as a surrogate for M. tuberculosis. BCG was enumerated by growing serial dilutions on sealed oleate-albumin-dextrose-catalase-enriched Middlebrook 7H10 agar plates for 2 to 3 weeks at 37°C with 5% CO₂.
Bacterial Endospores. *B. anthracis* Sterne strain 7702 (pXO1⁺ pXO2⁻) was kindly provided by Dr. Adam Driks (Loyola University Medical Center). Spores were prepared using the method described by Harwood and Cutting (15). Briefly, the Sterne strain was grown vegetatively in LB media (overnight at 37°C). Schaeffer’s sporulation agar (SSA) plates were then inoculated with these vegetative cells and incubated overnight at 30°C. Isolated colonies from the SSA plates were picked and suspended in Schaeffer’s sporulation medium (SSM). Aliquots (200 µl) of this bacterial suspension were spread on SSA plates, which were then incubated for 3 hr at 37°C. Following incubation, the SSA plates were flooded with 5 ml of SSM to suspend the cells. This bacterial suspension was used to inoculate 30 ml volumes of SSM at an OD₆₀₀ of 0.01. These cell cultures were then incubated at 37°C with vigorous aeration (250 rpm). Spores were harvested via centrifugation at 5250 x g for 10 min in a swinging bucket rotor 20 hr after the cell culture reached stationary growth phase. The spore pellets were then washed 5 times with cold DI water and pooled to form a spore stock with a final concentration of ~1.7x10⁹ spores ml⁻¹. Finally, the stock was heat treated at 65°C for 30 min to kill any remaining viable vegetative cells.

ELISA for detection of ECTV-specific antibody. ECTV-specific immunoglobulin G (IgG) levels in sera were determined by ELISA using purified ECTV as previously described (5). Briefly, flat-bottom 96-well Immulon 2B ELISA plates (Thermo Scientific) were coated with purified ECTV. Sera were assayed at a dilution of 1:50, and ECTV-specific Ab was detected by using horseradish peroxidase-conjugated goat anti-mouse IgG.
Soft X-ray enhanced ESP. The soft X-ray enhanced ESP used in this study was designed and built in-house and has been described in detail elsewhere (17, 26). Briefly, the ESP consisted of a cylindrical, stainless-steel collection electrode (25.4 cm in length and 5 cm in diameter) surrounding a discharge electrode (0.323 mm diameter stainless-steel wire). The collecting electrode was enclosed on the outside by a PVC tube to shield against leaking X-rays. A circular hole (2 cm in diameter) was drilled in the middle of the PVC tube and collection electrode through which a fitted soft X-ray emitter (Model L6941-1, Hamamatsu Photonics Ltd., Japan) could irradiate the region inside the ESP. A high voltage power supply (EL series, Glassman High Voltage Inc., High Bridge, NJ) was used to apply a potential difference between the centrally located charging electrode and the cylindrical collection electrode.

Physical characterization of soft X-ray enhanced ESP. Corona inception voltage. A buffer solution (Dulbecco’s Modified Eagle’s Medium) was aerosolized in a bioaerosol nebulizing generator (BANG) using compressed air and delivered at 1.5 lpm directly to the ESP system through 3/8” I.D. flexible Tygon® tubing. Physical measurements of total particle concentration was measured at that the outlet of the ESP using an ultrafine condensation particle counter (CPC) (Model 3022a, TSI Inc., Shoreview, MN) while various potential differences (ie., applied voltages ranging from 0 to -8kV) were formed across the discharge and collecting electrodes with and without soft X-ray irradiation.

Ozone generation. Particle-free compressed air was delivered at 1.5 lpm to the ESP system through 3/8” I.D. flexible Tygon® tubing. Ozone concentration was measured at the outlet of the ESP using an ozone analyzer (Model 49i, Thermo Scientific) while
various potential differences (ie., applied voltages ranging from \(-10\text{kV}\) to \(+10\text{kV}\)) were formed across the discharge and collecting electrodes with and without soft X-ray irradiation. 

*Particle collection efficiencies.* A suspension containing 100 µL each of 50 nm, 100 nm, and 200 nm polystyrene latex (PSL) particles (Ladd Research, Williston, VT) in 9.7 mL DI water (giving concentrations of \(\sim 2.9 \times 10^{13}\), \(\sim 3.7 \times 10^{12}\), and \(\sim 4.6 \times 10^{11}\) particles/mL, respectively) was aerosolized in a bioaerosol nebulizing generator and delivered at 1.5 lpm to the ESP system which was operated under negative applied potentials \((-4, -5, -6, \text{ and } -7\text{kV})\) and positive applied potentials \((+4, +5, +6, \text{ and } +7\text{kV})\) with and without soft X-ray irradiation. Size-specific particle collection efficiencies of the ESP system were determined using a scanning mobility particle sizer (SMPS) to sample the outlet of the ESP. Particle collection efficiency, \(E_{dp}(\%)\), was defined as: 

\[
E_{dp} = 100 \left(1 - \frac{N_{dp,AV,X}}{N_{dp,\text{baseline}}} \right)
\]  

where \(N_{dp,AV,X}\) is the number concentration (cm\(^{-3}\)) of particles with diameter \(dp\) at the outlet of the ESP for a given applied voltage (AV) and X-ray setting (ON or OFF) and \(N_{dp,\text{baseline}}\) is the number concentration (cm\(^{-3}\)) of particles with diameter \(dp\) at the outlet of the ESP at 0 kV applied voltage and X-ray turned OFF. 

*Microbial Aerosol Exposures.* The same general exposure procedure was performed in each of the microbial challenge experiments. A biological suspension was aerosolized using the single-jet BANG with an air flowrate of 1.5 lpm and a liquid flowrate of 0.5 ml/min. The liquid- and airflows were controlled using a recirculating pump (Model...
QG50/QG50MB, Fluiding Metering, Inc., Syosset, NY) and an automated bioaerosol exposure system (14), respectively. The biological aerosol generated by the BANG unit was delivered at 1.5 lpm to the inlet of the soft x-ray enhanced ESP. Following electrostatic treatment in the ESP, the air stream was then sent to a nose-only inhalation exposure system (NOIES) (CH Technologies (USA), Inc., Westwood, NJ), which was comprised of a series of 12-port stackable manifolds, allowing simultaneous aerosol exposure to multiple mice. The BANG, ESP, and NOIES were connected in series using 3/8” I.D. flexible Tygon® tubing. The exhaust of the NOIES was sampled in its entirety using an AGI-4 impinger (Ace Glass Inc., Vineland, NJ) containing 20 mL DMEM (for ECTV) or 20 mL PBS (for BCG and \textit{B. anthracis}) at the manufacturer’s recommended flowrate of 5 lpm. ECTV, BCG, and \textit{B. anthracis} exposures were 15 min in duration.

All aspects of the microbial challenge experiments, including aerosolization, electrostatic treatment in the ESP, nose-only exposure, and effluent sampling were conducted inside a BSL2 safety cabinet. The collection electrode was wiped with Spor-Klenz (Steris Life Sciences, Menton, OH) after each trial and the system was flushed with clean, dry air for 5-10 min preceding the next trial. Air samples (blanks) were collected following the decontamination process on random occasions to assess carryover contamination, accounting for ~5% of all samples. 

ECTV. The ECTV aerosol was generated from a suspension of ECTV in DMEM media at an initial titer of $5.5 \times 10^6$ pfu/ml. The applied voltage regime of -5.25 to -5.75 kV was investigated because of the very low-intensity corona determined to result during soft X-ray irradiation at this setting. Two high-intensity corona conditions (-8 kV; X-ray OFF and ON), in addition to positive and negative controls, were included for comparison.
BCG. The BCG aerosol was generated from a suspension of BCG diluted in PBS + 0.04% Tween 80 to an initial titer of 2.4x10^7 CFU/ml. C57BL/6 mice were divided into six groups, including positive and negative controls, to investigate a low-intensity corona (-6 kV) and a high-intensity corona (-10 kV) condition with and without soft x-ray irradiation. At t=1 h post-exposure, whole lungs were extricated, homogenized, and plated in serial dilutions on sealed oleate-albumin-dextrose-catalase-enriched Middlebrook 7H10 agar plates from n=5 animals to assess initial lung burden in the mice.

B. anthracis. The B. anthracis endospore aerosol was generated from B. anthracis endospores suspended in sterile DI water at an initial titer of 1.7x10^9 CFU/ml. A/J mice were divided into six groups, including positive and negative controls, to investigate a low-intensity corona (-6 kV) and a high-intensity corona (-10 kV) condition with and without soft x-ray irradiation. At t=1 h post-exposure, whole lungs were extricated, homogenized, and plated in serial dilutions on LB agar plates from n=10 animals to assess initial lung burden in the mice.

Ovalbumin (OVA) Sensitization and Aerosol Exposure Protocol. An acute, OVA-induced allergic airway disease model similar to one described by Secor, Jr. et al. (34) was used. Briefly, male C57BL/6 mice were immunized with three weekly intraperitoneal injections of a suspension containing 25 µg of OVA (grade V, Sigma, St. Louis, MO) and 2 mg of aluminum hydroxide in 0.5 ml of 0.9% sodium chloride (Hospira, Inc., Lake Forest, IL). One week after the last injection the mice were placed in the NOIES and exposed to an electrostatically treated OVA-laden airstream for 20 min per day for 3 days. A 1% (w/v) OVA/DI water suspension was aerosolized using a
single-jet BANG as previously described. Mice were divided into 11 groups, including positive and negative controls, to investigate a range of potential differences across the electrodes (±4, ±6, ±8, and ±10kV) with and without soft x-ray irradiation. The exhaust of the NOIES was sampled in its entirety using an AGI-4 impinger containing 20 mL DI water at the manufacturer’s recommended flowrate of 5 lpm. All aspects of the OVA aerosol challenge experiments were conducted inside a BSL2 safety cabinet with the same decontamination procedures used as above. The mice were monitored for weight change during the 3-week sensitization period as well as the 3-day exposure period.

Bronchoalveolar Lavage. Twenty-four hours after the final OVA aerosol exposure, the mice were sacrificed by overdose of a ketamine/xylazine cocktail. At the time of sacrifice, the lungs were lavaged in situ with three 1 ml aliquots of phosphate buffer solution (PBS). The BAL fluid was centrifuged at 200 g for 10 min. The BAL supernatant was decanted and stored in cryovials at -70 °C for subsequent cytokine analysis. The remaining cells were analyzed via flow cytometry for various leukocyte populations.

Flow Cytometry. BAL samples were incubated with 20µl of appropriately diluted antibodies for 20 min at 4 °C. After staining, the cells were washed twice with PBS containing 1% fetal calf serum (PBS-1), fixed with 1% methanol-free formaldehyde in PBS-1, and relative fluorescence intensities were determined via flow cytometry using a FACS LSR II (BD Biosciences) and analyzed with FlowJo v7.2.2 software (Tree Star, Inc., Ashland, OR). The following fluorescence labeled monoclonal antibodies were
used: CD8a-Alexa 700 (Caltag Laboratories, Burlingame, CA), CD4-PAC Blue (RM4-5), CD11b-PerCP (M1/70), CD19-PE Cy7 (1D3), CD45-APC (30-F11), and GR1-FITC (RB6-8C5) (BD Pharmingen, San Jose, CA). CD45 profiles, in combination with side-scatter intensities, were first used to first differentiate CD45+ cells from erythrocytes, epithelial cells, and other debris in the sample. CD45+ cells (e.g. macrophage/monocytes, T cells, B cells and granulocytes) were then separated into distinct populations based on the amounts of CD11b and GR-1 proteins detected on their cell surface (1).

**BAL Cytokine Analysis.** The BAL supernatant fluid was allowed to thaw and then concentrated using an Amicon Centriplus YM-10 filtration device (Millipore Corporation, Beford, MA). Concentrated samples were then analyzed for IL-5 using cytometric bead array kits (BD Biosciences, San Jose, CA) according to manufacturer’s directions. The limit of detection was 10 pg ml⁻¹.

**Statistical Analysis.** Where applicable, data were analyzed by 1-way ANOVA followed by the Tukey multiple comparison test using GraphPad Prism 5.0 (GraphPad Software, La Jolla, CA).
RESULTS

Determination of corona inception voltage and other system characteristics of the soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitator. At the baseline condition of 0 kV applied voltage (X-ray OFF), a broad distribution of particle sizes was obtained which peaked at approximately $3.0 \times 10^5$ particles cm$^{-3}$ at a diameter of 75 nm. The increase in corona current and precipitous drop in outlet particle number concentration was evidence of corona inception at approximately -6 kV applied voltage (X-ray OFF) (Fig. 1A). The corona inception voltage is less clear in the X-ray ON condition. However, based on the magnitude of reduction in applied voltage shown in previous studies incorporating in-situ soft X-ray irradiation (17, 24, 26), a corona inception voltage of approximately -5.25 kV would be expected in the X-ray ON condition (Fig. 1A).

Ozone production was evaluated as a function of applied voltage in the presence and absence of soft X-ray. In general, ozone concentration increased as corona intensity increased at the outlet of the ESP (Fig. 1B). Trace levels of ozone were first detectable at applied voltages corresponding to corona initiation (Fig. 1A) and increased as the magnitude of applied voltage increased. Peak ozone concentrations occurred at the highest-intensity corona conditions, with ozone levels reaching 156 ppm at -10 kV, which was more than six-times higher than at the corresponding positive applied potential (+10 kV). No appreciable difference in ozone concentration was observed with and without soft X-ray irradiation.
To quantify size-specific particle collection efficiencies, a suspension of PSL particles was aerosolized and challenged to the ESP system. We observed a collection efficiency minimum in the 200-600 nm size range without soft X-ray irradiation (Figs. 2A and B). Incorporation of in-situ soft X-ray irradiation enhanced the capture efficiency of PSL particles in this size regime for both negative and positive applied potential conditions (Figs. 2A and B). Capture efficiency was increased two-fold to nine-fold depending on the magnitude of the applied voltage. Below 200 nm, particles are collected with near 100% efficiency without the aid of in-situ soft X-ray irradiation due to highly efficient diffusion charging of these particles. Overall, particle collection efficiency was generally higher for negative applied voltages compared to the same positive magnitude.

Soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitation protects against viral aerosol infection. To investigate conditions where soft X-ray irradiation was most likely to have the greatest contribution to particle removal, we focused on two applied voltages (-5.25 kV and -5.75 kV) where soft X-ray irradiation actually initiated a very low-intensity corona (Fig. 1A). Because ECTV infection is lethal for A/J mice, mortality was used as a biological indicator of ESP system performance. Mortality as a function of day post-exposure is plotted in Fig. 3A. The two X-ray OFF cohorts (-5.25 kV and -5.75 kV applied voltage) exhibited 100% mortality by 11 and 15 days post-exposure, respectively. The mortality rates in these two groups essentially followed that of the positive control group, which was exposed to the aerosolized ECTV agent with no electrostatic treatment. Not surprisingly, similar weight loss trends were also observed for these three groups, with nearly 20% loss in body weight precipitating death (data not shown). Incorporation
of *in-situ* soft X-ray irradiation at the -5.25 and -5.75 kV applied voltage conditions resulted in a considerable delay in the mean day of death of both cohorts, as well as lowered overall mortality rates (cohort mortality was reduced from 100% to 88% at -5.25kV and from 100% to 63% at -5.75kV). No mortality was observed in either of the -8kV cohorts.

Similar trends were also observed in the number of viable ECTV PFUs sampled from the effluent of the NOIES, where viable PFUs recovered in the impinger decreased as corona intensity increased (**Fig. 3B**). For example, at both the -5.25 and -5.75 kV applied potentials, impinger PFUs decreased when soft X-ray irradiation was included in the electrostatic treatment process (which coincided with initiation of very low-intensity coronas). No viable ECTV was recovered from the impinger after ramping up the applied voltage to -8 kV, an act that also increases corona intensity.

Blood serum was analyzed from all surviving mice at t = 29 d post-exposure for the presence of ECTV-specific IgG. The high intensity corona cohorts (-8 kV, X-ray ON and OFF) exhibited 0% seroconversion (**Table 1**), suggesting the ESP system afforded the mice complete protection from the ECTV aerosol at these conditions.

*Mycobacterial* respiratory infection is preventable using soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitation. To demonstrate that the soft X-ray enhanced ESP system could effectively remove larger microorganisms, such as bacteria, from an airstream, we challenged the ESP with BCG which causes a non-lethal infection in C57BL/6 mice. No
appreciable difference in weight change was observed between the negative control, positive control, and both of the low-intensity (-6 kV) corona groups (data not shown). The mice in both high intensity corona (-10 kV) groups did, however, experience a large transient weight loss in the first few days post-exposure (~15% of body weight at -10kV with X-ray OFF, ~20% at -10kV with X-ray ON), possibly due to ozone generation; however, this was quickly reversed by t=6 d post-exposure to parallel weight change in the other exposure groups. Lung infectivity burdens, the primary biological indicators of infection measured in this aerosol challenge, were obtained at t=1 hr post-exposure. Results indicate that only mice in the positive control group (BCG agent with no electrostatic treatment of the aerosol) had any measurable bacterial entrainment in their lungs (~1x10^3 CFU lung^-1) at t=1 hr post-exposure. All other plated lung samples were negative for BCG (data not shown). Aerosol measurements of the NOIES effluent also indicate efficient removal of airborne BCG, with impinger samples for the four various corona groups all negative for BCG compared to ~1x10^3 CFU mL^-1 for the positive control (data not shown).

Anthrax spores are effectively removed from an airstream using soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitation. To study whether the ESP system could efficiently remove bacterial endospores, we challenged the ESP with B. anthracis (Sterne strain) spores which can cause a lethal infection in A/J mice. Similar to the BCG aerosol challenge, no appreciable difference in weight change was observed between the negative control, positive control, and both of the low-intensity (-6 kV) corona groups (Fig. 4A). Again, the mice in both high intensity corona (-10 kV) groups did, however, experience a
large weight loss in the first few days post-exposure, then subsequently gained weight in parallel with all other exposure groups. Mortalities were only observed in the positive control mice (*B. anthracis* spores with no electrostatic treatment of the aerosol), with a 40% mortality rate obtained at 7 d post-exposure. No other group exhibited mortality during the 14-day post-exposure observation period (data not shown). Lung infectivity burdens obtained at t=1 hr post-exposure (Fig. 4B) indicated that the level of spores deposited in the lungs decreased as the ESP corona intensity increased, with fewer than 16 CFU lung\(^{-1}\) obtained for either high intensity corona group. No appreciable difference in lung infectivity burdens was observed with and without soft X-ray irradiation. Aerosol measurements of the NOIES effluent mirrored the lung infectivity burden patterns (Fig. 4C). Fewer CFUs were obtained from the impinger samples as the ESP corona intensity increased, with fewer than 5 CFU ml\(^{-1}\) obtained for the high intensity corona groups. Again, no appreciable difference was observed with and without soft X-ray irradiation.

**Airborne allergen concentration is attenuated using soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitation.** To test the ability of the ESP system to reduce the concentration of airborne allergens, we employed an ovalbumin-induced allergic airway disease (AAD) murine model. Ovalbumin-induced AAD, as defined in this study by the positive control group, had eosinophil and neutrophil frequencies of 79.3% and 3.4%, respectively in the bronchoalveolar lavage fluid (Fig. 5A and D). The negative control BAL fluid, by comparison, consisted of 0.99% eosinophils and 1.14% neutrophils. Thus, an influx of eosinophils in the bronchoalveolar fluid after inhalation of the OVA allergen was the key parameter detectable via flow cytometric analysis. When the potential
applied to the system was set to the mid- and low-intensity corona conditions (-8kV and -6kV), the resulting eosinophil frequencies in the BAL reflected that of the negative control where no OVA was inhaled (Fig. 5A). A further decrease in the applied potential to -4 kV (ie., no corona) resulted in a measurable increase in the eosinophil population in the BAL, indicating OVA penetration through the ESP system with subsequent downstream inhalation in the exposure chamber. This increase in eosinophil frequency at -4 kV was diminished under soft X-ray irradiation (although not statistically significantly different) indicating some degree of enhanced charging and particle removal was taking place. No other condition exhibited any effect of soft X-ray irradiation. No positive applied potential conditions exhibited elevated eosinophil frequencies (Fig. 5B). Overall, both eosinophil and neutrophil frequencies were lower under positive applied potentials compared to their respective negative applied potentials according to flow cytometric analysis.

Two items of note were observed at applied voltage conditions where ozone exposure was expected to occur (ie. ±8kV and ±10kV): (i.) an statistically significant (p ≤ 0.05) influx of eosinophils was observed at the high corona intensity -10kV condition (Fig. 5A) and (ii.) the primary cell population in the BAL were neutrophils not eosinophils (Fig. 5D and E compared to Fig. 5A and B). In an effort to control for these confounding effects, additional exposure experiments were conducted at ±10kV applied voltage (X-ray OFF and ON) using an aerosol generated from DI water devoid of OVA particles. Small statistical differences in eosinophil frequencies were found at -10 kV OFF and +10 kV OFF conditions compared to their respective “NO OVA” condition (Fig. 5C), as well as
in neutrophil frequencies at -10 kV OFF compared to the “NO OVA” condition (Fig. 5F).

Presumably, this is an artifact of low 'n' values (n=2-5) and the inherent variability in animal models.

Cytokine IL-5 levels in the BAL were used as a complimentary measure to flow cytometric analysis to quantify the physiological response to ovalbumin-induced AAD. Trends, here, closely resembled those in the eosinophil frequency data presented in Figs. 5A-C. AAD-positive mice expressed IL-5 levels of 9.2 pg mL\(^{-1}\), a value 26 times higher than the negative control (supplementary Fig. S1A and B). Elevated levels of IL-5 were only detected in the high- (10 kV) and mid-intensity (8 kV) corona conditions when operating under negative applied potentials (supplementary Fig. S1A). When we ramped down the potential applied to the SXC system to the low-intensity corona condition (-6 kV), the resulting IL-5 concentration in the BAL reflected that of the negative control where no OVA was inhaled. A further decrease in the applied potential to -4 kV (ie., no corona) resulted in a small increase in the BAL, indicating potential OVA penetration through the ESP system with subsequent downstream inhalation in the exposure chamber. When a positive applied potential was used, elevated levels of IL-5 were only measured at +10 kV (supplementary Fig. S1B). IL-5 concentrations increased by 17.4 and 7.9 times with and without soft x-ray irradiation, respectively, at this high-intensity corona condition compared to the negative control. No significance difference was observed in the IL-5 concentration in the BAL when controlling for the presence of OVA in the aerosol at the ±10 kV conditions (supplementary Fig. S1C).
The increase in neutrophil frequency and IL-5 concentration in BAL at high-intensity (±10 kV) corona conditions correlated with observed weight loss trends. Similar to the BCG and *B. anthracis* aerosol challenges, no appreciable difference in weight change was observed between the negative control, positive control, low-intensity (±6 kV), and no-corona (±4 kV) groups (data not shown). Mice in the high-intensity corona groups (-10 kV OFF/ON and +10 kV OFF/ON), however, experienced weight losses of ~26% and ~6%, respectively, during the 3-day OVA exposure period beginning at time t=0. We observed similar weight loss trends when controlling for the presence of OVA in the aerosol at the ±10 kV conditions (data not shown).
DISCUSSION

Our study demonstrates the ability of a soft X-ray enhanced electrostatic precipitator to efficiently remove airborne biological agents of various sizes and characteristics, thereby preventing respiratory infections and attenuating inhalation-induced allergic reactions. Surrogates for ultrafine particles, smallpox, tuberculosis, anthrax, and airborne allergens were all effectively removed from an airstream with the aid of a corona charger working in conjunction with soft X-ray irradiation.

Soft X-ray effect on particle removal. Previously published data suggest that soft X-ray irradiation enhances the capture efficiency of ultrafine particles in an electrostatic precipitator (26). However, that study investigated only inorganic particles. We, therefore, wanted to verify this soft X-ray effect on surrogate organic particles before proceeding with full-scale microbial and allergen exposures. Here, polystyrene latex spheres between 200-600nm in diameter were collected more efficiently using in-situ soft X-ray irradiation (Figs. 2A and B). Soft X-rays enhance the collection efficiency of particles in this ESP penetration window through an increase in particle charging efficiency brought about by the generation of more positive and negative ions in the head space of the ESP as well as by direct particle photoionization (17, 26).

From a biological perspective, the sub-micrometer size class is an important regime for virus and pollen fragment aerosols. ECTV was chosen as a test particle due to its size, which in its native state is 200 x 400 nm (2). In an effort to mimic droplet nuclei generated by a coughing individual associated with aerosol transmission, the ECTV
aerosol was generated from a liquid suspension. Enhanced charging and removal of ECTV particles and, hence, lower delivered doses of ECTV to the mice was evident with in-situ soft X-ray irradiation at low-intensity corona conditions. The pathogenesis of ECTV infection is a series of viral replication and dissemination events that eventually lead to systemic infection (2, 8). With fewer ECTV virions delivered to the lungs at the -5.25 and -5.75 kV applied voltage conditions with in-situ soft X-ray irradiation, the kinetics of viral replication at the site of infection followed by spread to the regional lymph nodes, bloodstream, and organs such as the spleen and liver would be slowed, thereby accounting for the observed decrease in mortality and overall delay in the mean day of death (Fig. 3A).

With asthma rates on the rise and inhalation of an assortment of allergens acting, in part, as an asthma trigger, we wanted to test the ability of the soft X-ray corona system to reduce the concentration of airborne allergens. To do so, ovalbumin protein was aerosolized from a liquid suspension (ie., the same nebulizer as in the microbial exposures) which would most closely represent a high relative humidity environment. Busse and Lemanske (3), in their detailed review of the immunology of asthma, explain that the challenge of the airway with allergen increases the local concentration of IL-5, which correlates directly with the degree of airway eosinophilia. Eosinophil frequency in the BAL fluid (attributable to OVA allergen exposure) was reduced in this study prior to the onset of a corona (Fig. 5A) with the aid of in-situ soft X-rays irradiation, another example of soft X-rays enhancing the charging and collection efficiency of sub-micrometer particles which subsequently led to lower exposure doses.
The BCG, *B. anthracis* spores, and a segment of the ECTV and OVA particle distributions were larger than the targeted size regime for soft X-ray enhanced charging, and consequently, little effect was observed with the addition of soft X-ray irradiation. As demonstrated in the PSL experiments, the bioaerosol nebulizer used in this study generates an aerosol with a distribution of particle sizes meaning that the particles entering the ESP are often different (ie., larger) than the native-state size of the biological particles. Relative humidity, drying time, buffer salt concentration, and in-flight agglomeration all play a role in dictating the overall size distribution. Particles the size of bacteria and bacterial endospores, which typically have diameters on the order of 1-2 µm, are very efficiently charged in the ESP without the need for X-ray enhancement. For these particles, a mechanism known as field charging, which is governed by the geometry and operational conditions of the ESP, is suitable for this task. Despite falling outside the targeted size regime of soft X-ray enhanced charging, BCG and *B. anthracis* were included in the exposure study to lend credence to the assertion that the soft X-ray ESP system is capable of removing biological particles across all size regimes.

Overall, the contribution of soft X-ray irradiation was also less evident as corona intensity increased due to the overwhelming effects of ions generated by the corona itself. At the high intensity corona conditions, where ion concentrations can approach $10^6$-$10^9$ cm$^{-3}$ (16), nearly complete protection from viral and bacterial respiratory infection was afforded to the murine models for all biological agents tested. In general, as corona intensity increased, the primary indicators of infection (mortality and lung infectivity burden) decreased.
Confounding effects of ozone generation. The soft X-ray corona system through which these particles are travelling produces a localized plasma, or region of ionized gas, in the immediate vicinity surrounding the stainless steel wire (or discharge electrode). These ions then attach to or interact with gas molecules generating reactive species (18), including O$_3$ and various radicals. In addition to charging the biological agents and removing them in the electrical field, the ions and O$_3$ in the system may act as both a bactericide and viricide as the ability of O$_3$ to inactivate microbes is well-established. The amount of viral inactivation occurring in an ESP has been reported for bacteriophages (24). Additionally, studies investigating the effect of reactive species (excluding O$_3$) from a corona discharge on dust mite and cat allergens have shown that these allergens, which differ structurally for one another, can be destroyed by exposure to the corona discharge products (10, 11). Similar results were obtained with Japanese cedar pollen (23).

Aside from the effluent ozone concentrations reported (Fig. 1B), three pieces of evidence in this study attest to the ‘reactive’ nature within the ESP. First, in the ECTV challenge, only two of the four low-intensity corona conditions (-5.25 kV OFF and -5.75 OFF) had impinger samples that tested positive for viable ECTV, whereas mice succumbed to infection and either died or seroconverted in all four of these conditions. One could argue that infectious ECTV particles were present in the NOIES, but were inactivated downstream during the aerosol sampling process. The 15-min sampling period may have provided additional time for reactive species generated in the ESP to contact the ECTV
virions. Alternatively, sufficient virus was present in the NOIES to infect, but just not at detectable levels for the infectivity plaque assay. Secondly, mice in all high-intensity corona exposure groups (ie., -10 kV) experienced considerable weight loss in the first few days post-exposure, despite showing no indication of infection. Lastly, AAD symptoms such as influxes in neutrophils and increases in IL-5 cytokine levels were present in mice exposed to a mock aerosol devoid of any OVA particles that had been electrostatically treated at high-intensity corona conditions (Fig. 5C and F). O₃-induced acute lung injury is well-documented in inbred mouse strains (9, 33, 41) and has been shown to elevate neutrophil levels in BAL fluid (39), exacerbate eosinophilic airway inflammation (25), and increase the levels of eosinophil survival factors (including IL-5) in the BAL (25).

The measured ozone concentrations taken directly from the outlet of the ESP are sufficiently high to pose a human health hazard. For comparison, the National Institute for Occupational Health and Safety recommended ozone exposure limit for humans is 0.1 ppm (4). When operated under positive applied potentials, however, O₃ production was considerably minimized while still maintaining efficient collection of all particle types. A downstream ozone absorber, such as granular activated carbon, could be incorporated into the instrument design to meet this ozone exposure threshold.

In summary, HEPA performance specifications require removal of airborne particles >0.3 µm with 99.97% efficiency, which as a target, was met and exceeded by the soft X-ray corona system. As a control device, the soft X-ray corona system is well-suited for
removal of ultrafine particles, infectious biological aerosols, and airborne allergens. This advanced proof of concept study has demonstrated effective control of respiratory infections from agents across a broad spectrum of particle sizes and morphologies. The anti-microbial effects of the generated O₃, in theory, could be harnessed to allow the system to act as a hybrid mitigation technology - combining particle capture with the destruction of the biological activity of captured particles to make system cleaning and maintenance safer compared to a HEPA system. Incorporation of soft X-ray irradiation lowers the corona inception voltage and targets an important size class that traditional electrostatic precipitation inefficiently captures. The prototype investigated here could be easily modified and scaled for installation in HVAC systems in aircraft cabins as well as residential or commercial buildings. It is a far superior alternative to HEPA filtration, both from a performance viewpoint and operational cost. While flow-through filtration systems can be designed to capture fine particles, they do not inactivate them and are plagued with very high pressure drops and operational constraints. Optimal system design and operating conditions would have to be explicitly studied, but would most likely include a positive potential-induced low intensity corona with downstream ozone absorber to provide efficient particle removal while limiting ozone emissions.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This work was supported in part by NIH grant U54 AI05716003 to the Midwest Regional Center of Excellence for Biodefense and Emerging Infectious Diseases Research (MRCE) and Saint Louis University start-up funds (R.M.L.B). The authors declare no competing financial interests. Technical assistance from Dr. Divey Saini (Duke Human Vaccine Institute) is also graciously acknowledged.
REFERENCES


eosinophilic airway inflammation and hyperresponsiveness in allergen-sensitized mice. Allergy 63:438-446.


isolation on outcome of allogeneic bone marrow transplantation for leukemia. Bone Marrow Transplant. 21:1231-1238.


Figure 1.
Figure 2.
Figure 3.
Figure 4.
Table 1. ECTV-specific immunoglobulin G (IgG) detection in the sera of surviving mice measured at t=29 days post-exposure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Applied Voltage (kV)</th>
<th>Soft X-Ray</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mortality</th>
<th>Sero-positive</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-8 ON</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0/8 (0%)</td>
<td>0/8 (0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-8 OFF</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>0/8 (0%)</td>
<td>0/8 (0%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-5.75 ON</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>5/8 (62.5%)</td>
<td>3/3 (100%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-5.75 OFF</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8/8 (100%)</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-5.25 ON</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7/8 (87.5%)</td>
<td>1/1 (100%)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-5.25 OFF</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8/8 (100%)</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0 OFF</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>8/8 (100%)</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>